

Global Family Medicine: A 'UNIVERSAL' Mnemonic

William B. Ventres, MD, MA

In this essay, I borrow the idea of universal precautions from infection control and suggest that family physicians use a set of considerations, based on the mnemonic UNIVERSAL, to nurture cultural humility, enter a metaphoric “space-in-between” in cross-cultural encounters, and foster global fluency. These UNIVERSAL considerations I base on my experiences in global family medicine, attending to economically poor and socially marginalized patients in both international and domestic settings. They are informed by readings in transcultural psychiatry, medical anthropology, development studies, and primary care. I invite others involved in global family medicine to reflect on what they have learned along their own professional paths, so as to enhance their therapeutic abilities as global family physicians, wherever they may be. (J Am Board Fam Med 2017;30:104–108.)

Keywords: Medical Anthropology; Cross-Cultural Comparison; Global Health; Medical Education; Physicians, Family; Primary Health Care

There are many available paths to practicing global family medicine.^{1–5} I have walked mine for over 25 years in safety net clinics and corrections health in the United States. I have also practiced and taught medicine, public health, and medical anthropology for extended periods of time in various international settings. My experiences as a global family physician have not only fed my sense of feeling fortunate in having found a gratifying professional niche,⁶ but also helped me sustain a sense of professional meaning during a time of often confusing organizational change. They have confirmed for me that family medicine is a vital component of any

rational system of health care, whether at home or elsewhere around the world.^{7–9}

My work as a global family physician has also confirmed that it is extremely challenging for any of us to see beyond our enculturation, the net sum of historic, environmental, and interpersonal influences that both socialize us to think in particular ways and limit our abilities to perceive, comprehend, or engage with people who think, communicate, and act in ways differently than we do.¹⁰ That we come from an economically and politically powerful country and have been trained in an increasingly fragmented professional culture risks that we may not aptly understand the complexity of the concerns that people in the majority world face, the needs they have, or the burdens under which they toil.¹¹ Indeed, practicing family medicine effectively in any context means paying attention to issues whose origins and solutions lie beyond the strict confines of a biomedical worldview.

Toward Global Fluency

To enhance our abilities as capable and competent global family physicians it is important that we enter a metaphoric space in between us and our patients,¹² a place where ideas and actions are co-created and conurtured with others through expressions of respect, trust, and equanimity. Such a space-in-between can enhance cultural humility,¹³

This article was externally peer reviewed.

Submitted 19 February 2016; revised 16 May 2016; accepted 31 May 2016.

From the Institute for Studies in History, Anthropology, and Archeology, University of El Salvador, San Salvador; Department of Family Medicine, Oregon Health and Science University, Portland, OR.

Funding: none.

Prior presentation: I presented versions of this work as the Daniel J. Ostergaard, MD, Lecturer on Global Health at the American Academy of Family Physicians' Global Health Workshop in Denver, Colorado (October 2, 2015); and as an Alpha Omega Alpha Visiting Professor at the University of Arizona College of Medicine, in Tucson, Arizona (January 28, 2016).

Conflict of interest: none declared.

Corresponding author: William B. Ventres, MD, MA, Urbanización Buenos Aires III, Block H, Calle Los Maquilishuat No. 3-A, San Salvador, El Salvador (E-mail: wventres@gmail.com).

an accurate and honest relational worldview born not from a position of subservience but from the recognition that other points of view are worthy of consideration.

Given that the opportunities to grow our professional competencies as global family physicians may occur throughout the course of any particular day, it is important that we are prepared to explore these issues at a moment's notice. Borrowing from the use of universal precautions as an effective approach to control infection and promote health,¹⁴ I suggest we adopt a set of UNIVERSAL considerations to limit cross-cultural misunderstandings and foster global fluency, the ability to dialog honestly with patients, family members, professional colleagues, and community partners, regardless of the location or situation in which we may find ourselves.

The UNIVERSAL Mnemonic

The 9 principles that follow (Table 1), each represented by 1 letter in the mnemonic UNIVERSAL, are based on my experiences and informed by readings in transcultural psychiatry, medical anthropology, development studies, and primary care. My intent is not that they promise simplistic secrets for success in global family medicine, but prompt reflective inquiry to help family physicians anywhere cultivate a curious, open, and engaging stance vis-à-vis their patients and the communities in which they live.

These UNIVERSAL considerations include:

Unlearn

Consciously put to the side, at least momentarily, the preconceptions and beliefs with which we enter into encounters with others, acknowledging that other people regularly hold other points of view,

Table 1. UNIVERSAL Considerations in Global Medicine and Global Health

U = Unlearn
N = Notice Context
I = Be Inquisitive
V = Recognize Human Vulnerability
E = Open our Eyes
R = Build Lasting Relationships
S = Grow in Solidarity
A = Appreciate our Interdependency
L = Learn

sometimes poles apart from ours. Put to the side differences such as history, class, and background, opening up a willingness to listen and accept at face value those diverse perspectives. Put to the side the power that comes from having a MD or DO (or even PhD) after one's name, allowing a human connection to form before a medical one.¹⁵

Notice Context

Although other family doctors may have different views on the meaning of "family" in "family medicine," I think of "family" as a metaphor for the context of all that is not strictly biomedical in our work, representing the psychosocial aspects of the biopsychosocial model that acts as a foundational guide to holistic patient care.¹⁶ In other words, recognize both the obvious and nuanced dimensions of "family," incorporate these dimensions into diagnosis and treatment, and care for patients as individuals at the same time mindful of their presence in families and communities. Practice family medicine.

Be Inquisitive

As the use of electronic medical records proliferates and measurement science advances,¹⁷⁻¹⁹ there will be increasing pressure to practice check box medicine (providing data for population-based inquiry). Resist this influence. Check or tick boxes may be useful for certain procedural activities and analyzing large data sets; their structure, however, obviates the kind of sensitivity to learning about the individual and cultural differences with which patients present, anywhere in the world.²⁰ Adopt a questioning approach to patient and community concerns, regardless of setting.²¹

Recognize Human Vulnerability

Vulnerability in the face of illness is perhaps the 1 quality common to all people across boundaries of geography, ethnicity, and time. Recognize this. How vulnerability manifests in people may vary greatly, as does the counterbalancing quality of hope. Explore how they are both commonly expressed in practice environments, understand that even within communities people's expression of suffering and resilience differ, and use the power of this knowledge to enhance therapeutic efficacy and care.²²

Open our Eyes

Perception, integration, and application: these are 3 important stages in the development of any habit of practice, whether in global medicine or public health, especially when acknowledging and attending to the effects social determinants have on health. Perception, the first stage, is not as easy as it sounds; there are many factors that distract us from seeing what is evidently right before our eyes.²³ Exercise the senses to engage the mind in honest, realistic, and inclusive assessments of upstream causes and downstream effects on disease and illness.²⁴

Build Lasting Relationships

Continuity is a core value in family medicine as practiced in the United States.²⁵ It is no less important abroad. Especially when work in international settings may be of relatively brief periods of time, spread out over years and years,²⁶ the personal relationships one develops may be the most lasting result of one's efforts,²⁷ particularly in areas made volatile by the ugliness of politics, the shock of violence, or the atrocities of war. Although intercontinental communication has been made easier during the last few decades, maintaining relationships at a distance may also be 1 of the most problematic parts of global health work. Make nurturing ongoing relationships part of any global endeavor.

Grow in Solidarity

Simply put, work *with* patients, families, and communities, not just *for* them. Although much has been written, and eloquently so, about solidarity as a manifestation of social justice in the delivery of medical care at home and around the world,²⁸ social justice is not something we blithely give to people. Solidarity signifies recognizing, in partnership with others, the structural forces that contribute to poor health outcomes, just as it signifies recognizing, with others, the structural barriers that negatively affect our abilities to attend to those forces. Solidarity signifies working with others to lessen the adverse influence of these factors, as we all are able. As such, remember this: solidarity is something we share.²⁹

Appreciate our Interdependency

Remember, too, how our day-to-day worlds are intimately connected to the worlds of those for and

with whom we work and are increasingly connected to those outside our immediate influence.³⁰ That we live, in the United States, in an increasingly pluralistic society,^{31,32} that globalization has altered traditional patterns of goods and jobs,³³ that we must pay attention to clinical conditions only until recently encountered on the other side of globe,^{34,35} and that we must face the looming specter of climate change are all evidence of this reality.^{36,37}

Learn

Ultimately, the process of working in global family medicine is one of learning. True learning implies welcoming a definitive change in some aspect of our lives: incorporate this deliberate intent into the process.³⁸ Build on what we know by inviting other practices and knowledge into our observed awareness; cultivate a sense of mystery and wonderment in the face of new understandings; nurture the ability to reflect on it all; and, develop deep connections through relationship and relationships³⁹: these are our tasks as global family physicians.

Further Considerations

Some may read this essay and respond that the practice of global family medicine is principally one of diagnosis and treatment across the breadth of medicine from birth to death. I do not disagree with the fact that we must be adept at applying in the science of medicine as it applies to our discipline. I do contend, however, that we have options as to how we conduct the technical and scientific aspects of our work, and that we are more successful when we do so with care and compassion, inviting the engagement of others.

Others may note that the UNIVERSAL considerations above are not focused solely on international work. I agree. The changing dynamics of our world demand that global family medicine be practiced everywhere, whether in North America or on other continents. Issues of access to care, resource availability, and appropriately trained personnel are not solely concerns outside the United States. They exist everywhere.

Still others may suggest that the power of our market-based medical-industrial complex is just too great for family medicine to thrive across the globe, and that our privatized, high-technology, subspecialty-based model should be replicated elsewhere.

I completely disagree. Strong evidence—our dismal record at successfully lowering overall rates of morbidity and mortality at home⁴⁰ (even with extraordinarily high medically related expenditures in contrast with other countries⁴¹), coupled with ample validation of family medicine’s role as an appropriate alternative to this failure^{42,43}—belies this suggestion. Although all global medical practitioners risk being sucked into the vortex of transmitting inappropriate models of medical care to environments where they are neither sustainable nor feasible—such actions can actually do grievous harm to the general health of the population by encouraging priorities incompatible with the local realities of those most in need—global family physicians have the potential to understand this susceptibility and minimize untoward consequences.

Conclusion

As encapsulated in the UNIVERSAL mnemonic, I have summarized the lessons I have learned on my professional path as a global family physician. I hope these lessons prompt others to reflect on what they have learned on their own paths, for each of us who has contributed to the work of global medicine and public health has our own unique history. As we recall the experiences that have taught us, let us also remember that the real work of family medicine occurs neither in a moment’s passing nor alone. In family medicine, we do best by working alongside patients, family members, community partners, and other professional colleagues, over time. Let us remember that, and may it guide our paths as agents of healing,⁴⁴ wherever we may be.

I thank Katherine Culhane-Pera, MD, MA; and Calvin Wilson, MD, for their critical comments on previous revisions of this essay.

To see this article online, please go to: <http://jabfm.org/content/30/1/104.full>.

References

1. Haq C, Ventres W, Hunt V, et al. Acad Med 1995; 70:370–80.
2. Ferrer RL. A piece of my mind: Within the system of no-system. JAMA 2001;286:2513–4.
3. Magill MK. Something that lasts: Reflections on the practice of family medicine in a developing country. Fam Med 1998;30:744–7.
4. Macdonald WA. Social accountability: Nunavut perspective. Can Fam Physician 2016;62:377–9.
5. Evert J, Bazemore A, Hixon A, Withy K. Going global: Considerations for introducing global health into family medicine training programs. Fam Med 2007;39:659–65.
6. Ventres WB. Cultural encounters in family medicine: Six lessons from South America. J Am Board Fam Pract 1997;10:232–6.
7. World Health Organization. The World Health Report 2008: Primary Health Care Now More Than Ever. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization; 2008. Available from: http://www1.paho.org/hq/dmdocuments/2010/PHC_The_World_Health_Report-2008.pdf. Accessed May 15, 2016.
8. Kidd MR, Anderson MI, Obazee EM, Prasad PN, Pettigrew LM. World Organization of Family Doctors’ executive committee. The need for global primary care development indicators. Lancet 2015;386: 737.
9. World Health Organization. New partnership to help countries close gaps in primary health care. 2015 September 26. Available from: <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/releases/2015/partnership-primary-health-care/en/>. Accessed May 15, 2016.
10. Ventres W, Haq C. Toward a cultural consciousness of self-in-relation: From “us and them” to “we”. Fam Med 2014;46:691–5.
11. Ventres WB, Fort MP. Eyes wide open: An essay on engaged awareness in global medicine and public health. BMC International Health Human Rights 2014;14:29. Available from: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-698X/14/29>.
12. Ventres WB. Building power between polarities: On the space-in-between. Qual Health Res 2016;26: 345–50.
13. Tervalon M, Murray-García J. Cultural humility versus cultural competence: A critical distinction in defining physician training outcomes in multicultural education. J Health Care Poor Underserved 1998;9:117–25.
14. Occupational Safety and Health Administration, United States Department of Labor. Healthcare Wide Hazards: (Lack of) Universal Precautions. Available from: <https://www.osha.gov/SLTC/etools/hospital/hazards/univprec/univ.html>. Accessed May 15, 2016.
15. Harcourt W. Revisiting global body politics in Nepal: A reflexive analysis. Glob Public Health 2016; 11(1–2):236–51.
16. Borrell-Carrió F, Suchman AL, Epstein RM. The biopsychosocial model 25 years later: Principles, practice, and scientific inquiry. Ann Fam Med 2004; 2:576–82.
17. Ventres W, Kooienga S, Vuckovic N, Marlin R, Nygren P, Stewart V. Physicians, patients, and the electronic health record: An ethnographic analysis. Ann Fam Med 2006;4:124–31.
18. McGlynn EA, McDonald KM, Cassel CK. Measurement is essential for improving diagnosis and reduc-

- ing diagnostic error: A report from the Institute of Medicine. *JAMA* 2015;314:2501–2.
19. Saver BG, Martin SA, Adler RN, et al. Care that matters: Quality measurement and health care. *PLoS Med* 2015;12:e1001902.
 20. Cleland J, Reeve J, Rosenthal J, Johnston P. Resisting the tick box culture: Refocusing medical education and training. *Br J Gen Pract* 2014;64:422–3.
 21. Ventres WB. The Q-list manifesto: How to get things right in generalist medical practice. *Fam Syst Health* 2015;33:5–13.
 22. Egnaw TR. Suffering, meaning, and healing: Challenges of contemporary medicine. *Ann Fam Med* 2009;7:170–5.
 23. Ventres W, Gusoff G. Poverty blindness: Exploring the diagnosis and treatment of an epidemic condition. *J Health Care Poor Underserved* 2014; 25:52–62.
 24. Braveman PA, Egerter SA, Woolf SH, Marks JS. When do we know enough to recommend action on the social determinants of health? *Am J Prev Med* 2011;40(1 Suppl 1):S58–S66.
 25. Guthrie B, Saultz JW, Freeman GK, Haggerty JL. Continuity of care matters. 2008; *BMJ* 2008;337: a867.
 26. Palazuelos D, Dhillon R. Addressing the “global health tax” and “wild cards”: Practical challenges to building academic careers in global health. *Acad Med* 2016;91:30–5.
 27. Ventres WB, Wilson CL. Teaching (and learning) family medicine internationally: A cultural survival guide. *Fam Pract* 1995;12:324–7.
 28. Hixon AL, Yamada S, Farmer PE, Maskarinec GG. Social justice: The heart of medical education. *Soc Med* 2013;7:161–8.
 29. Jennings B, Dawson A. SOLIDARITY in the moral imagination of bioethics. *Hastings Cent Rep* 2015; 45:31–8.
 30. Ventres W, Dharamsi S, Ferrer R. From social determinants to social interdependency: Theory, reflection, and engagement. *Soc Med*. In press.
 31. Cole PM. Cultural competence now mainstream medicine. Responding to increasing diversity and changing demographics. *Postgrad Med* 2004;116:51–3.
 32. Pottie K, Hostland S. Health advocacy for refugees: medical student primer for competence in cultural matters and global health. *Can Fam Physician* 2007; 53:1923–6.
 33. Labonté R, Mohindra K, Schrecker T. The growing impact of globalization for health and public health practice. *Annu Rev Public Health* 2011;32:263–83.
 34. Rew KT, Clarke SL, Gossa W, Savin D. Immigrant and refugee health: Medical evaluation. *FP Essent* 2014;423:11–8.
 35. Hauck FR, Corr KE, Lewis SH, Oliver MN. Health and health care of African refugees: An underrecognized minority. *J Natl Med Assoc* 2012;104(1–2):61–71.
 36. Barrett B, Charles JW, Temte JL. Climate change, human health, and epidemiological transition. *Prev Med* 2015;70:69–75.
 37. Ahlgren I, Yamada S, Wong A. Rising oceans, climate change, food aid, and human rights in the Marshall Islands. *Health Hum Rights* 2014;16: 69–80.
 38. Sterling S. Sustainable Education: Re-Visioning Learning and Change. Schumacher Briefings. Cambridge, UK: Green Books, Ltd; 2001.
 39. Ventres WB. The joys of global medicine and the lesson of relationship. *Am J Med* 2016;129:771–2. (Companion educational mini-documentary available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Nz0rcerbTqE>).
 40. Bezruchka S. The hurrier I go the behinder I get: The deteriorating international ranking of U.S. health status. *Annu Rev Public Health* 2012;33: 157–73.
 41. Thompson D. 10 ways to visualize how Americans spend money on health care. *The Atlantic*. 2012 March 19. Available from: <http://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2012/03/10-ways-to-visualize-how-americans-spend-money-on-health-care/254736/>. Accessed May 15, 2016.
 42. Starfield B. Reinventing primary care: Lessons from Canada for the United States. *Health Aff (Millwood)* 2010;29:1030–6.
 43. Macinko J, Starfield B, Erinosh T. The impact of primary healthcare on population health in low- and middle-income countries. *J Ambul Care Manage*. 2009;32:150–71.
 44. Ventres WB. Healing. *Ann Fam Med* 2016;14: 76–8.